Recruitment and Selection Law for Local Government Employers

Diane M. Juffras

2013
The School of Government at the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill works to improve the lives of North Carolinians by engaging in practical scholarship that helps public officials and citizens understand and improve state and local government. Established in 1931 as the Institute of Government, the School provides educational, advisory, and research services for state and local governments. The School of Government is also home to a nationally ranked graduate program in public administration and specialized centers focused on information technology and environmental finance.

As the largest university-based local government training, advisory, and research organization in the United States, the School of Government offers up to 200 courses, webinars, and specialized conferences for more than 12,000 public officials each year. In addition, faculty members annually publish approximately fifty books, book chapters, bulletins, and other reference works related to state and local government. Each day that the General Assembly is in session, the School produces the Daily Bulletin, which reports on the day’s activities for members of the legislature and others who need to follow the course of legislation.

The Master of Public Administration Program is a full-time, two-year program that serves up to sixty students annually. It consistently ranks among the best public administration graduate programs in the country, particularly in city management. With courses ranging from public policy analysis to ethics and management, the program educates leaders for local, state, and federal governments and nonprofit organizations.

Operating support for the School of Government’s programs and activities comes from many sources, including state appropriations, local government membership dues, private contributions, publication sales, course fees, and service contracts. Visit www.sog.unc.edu or call 919.966.5381 for more information on the School’s courses, publications, programs, and services.
Summary Contents

Preface xv
Introduction 1

Chapter 1
An Overview of the Laws Governing Recruitment and Selection 13

Chapter 2
Discrimination Law in the Recruitment and Selection Context 33

Chapter 3
Defining and Advertising the Job 109

Chapter 4
Personnel Policies Related to Recruitment and Selection 139
Chapter 5
Lawful and Unlawful Questions: Applications and Interviewing 159

Chapter 6
Testing of Applicants and Candidates for Promotion: Written Examinations 211

Chapter 7
Testing of Applicants and Candidates for Promotion: Physical Ability Tests and Assessment Centers 247

Chapter 8
Background Investigations of Applicants for Employment: Criminal Records, Credit History, Reference, and Internet Checks 263

Chapter 9
Hiring Employees versus Engaging Independent Contractors 311

Chapter 10
Applicant Records: Confidentiality and Retention 345

Appendixes 357

Indexes 401
Table of Contents

Preface xv

Introduction 1

North Carolina Local Government and Community College Employers: Who Are They? 5
  Community Colleges 5
  Local Government Entities Not Covered by This Book 6

Small Employers 6

Initial Hiring versus Promoting from Within 7

A Summary of the Book’s Contents 8

Chapter 1

An Overview of the Laws Governing Recruitment and Selection 13

  1.1 The Common Law Rule of Employment at Will 15
  1.2 Hiring Authority in North Carolina Local Government 17
    1.2.1 Hiring Authority in North Carolina Municipalities 17
    1.2.2 Hiring Authority in North Carolina Counties 19
    1.2.3 Hiring Authority in Mental Health Area Authorities/Local Management Entities 25
    1.2.4 Hiring Authority in Other Kinds of Local Government Entities 26
1.3 Hiring Authority in North Carolina’s Community Colleges 26

1.4 Laws Affecting the Process of Recruitment and Selection 27
   1.4.1 The Fair Credit Reporting Act 27
   1.4.2 The Immigration Reform and Control Act 28
   1.4.3 North Carolina’s E-Verify Requirement 28
   1.4.4 The Law Protecting the Lawful Use of Lawful Products 29
   1.4.5 North Carolina’s Requirement of United States Selective Service Registration 30
   1.4.6 North Carolina’s Defense against Civil Liability for Truthful Job References 30
   1.4.7 North Carolina’s Prohibition against Requiring Applicants to Pay the Cost of Exams or Records 30

Chapter 2
Discrimination Law in the Recruitment and Selection Context 33

2.1 Title VII of the Civil Rights Act of 1964: Prohibition against Hiring Decisions Made on the Basis of Race, Color, Gender, Religion, or National Origin 38
   2.1.1 Disparate Treatment or Intentional Discrimination in Hiring: The Basic Theory 38
   2.1.2 Disparate Treatment or Intentional Discrimination in Making Promotions 42
   2.1.3 Mixed Motives: When Discrimination Is Only One Factor in a Decision Not to Hire or Promote 43
   2.1.4 The Bona Fide Occupational Qualification Defense to a Charge of Disparate Treatment or Intentional Discrimination 44
   2.1.5 A Closer Look at Title VII Disparate Treatment or Intentional Discrimination 45
   2.1.6 Disparate Impact or Unintentional Discrimination in Hiring: The Basic Theory 57
   2.1.7 A Closer Look at Title VII Disparate Impact or Unintentional Discrimination 62

2.2 The Age Discrimination in Employment Act of 1967: Prohibition against Hiring Decisions Made on the Basis of Age over 40 69
   2.2.1 Disparate Treatment or Unintentional Discrimination under the ADEA 70
   2.2.2 A Closer Look at Disparate Treatment under the ADEA: Mixed-Motive Cases 80
3.2 Legal Issues Raised by Job Advertisements

3.2.1 Accountant Wanted: A Hypothetical Job Advertisement

3.2.2 Advertising a Position

3.2.3 Choosing Not to Advertise a Position

3.2.4 Using the North Carolina Employment Security Commission to Advertise Positions and Screen Applicants

Chapter 4

Personnel Policies Related to Recruitment and Selection

4.1 Residency Requirements

4.1.1 Three Types of Legal Challenges to Residency Requirements

4.2 Anti-Nepotism Policies

4.3 Policies Prohibiting the Rehiring of Former Employees

Chapter 5

Lawful and Unlawful Questions: Applications and Interviewing

An Initial Matter: Application versus Interview

Expressly Unlawful Questions versus Questions Better Left Unasked

5.1 Expressly Unlawful Questions: The Americans with Disabilities Act

5.1.1 The ADA’s Prohibition on Pre-Offer Medical Inquiries and Examinations

5.1.2 Areas That Employers Typically Want to Explore with Applicants

5.1.3 When Is an Offer an Offer for ADA Purposes?

5.1.4 Post-Offer Medical Examinations

5.1.5 Withdrawing an Offer Based on the Results of a Medical Inquiry or Examination

5.2 Expressly Unlawful Questions: The Genetic Information Nondiscrimination Act

5.2.1 What Happens When an Employer Violates the ADA or GINA’s Rules on Medical Questions and Examinations?
Chapter 6
Testing of Applicants and Candidates for Promotion: Written Examinations

6.1 Scored Testing and Disparate Impact: A Hypothetical
6.2 Step One: Conducting a Job Analysis
6.3 Step Two: Constructing a Written Test of Knowledge, Skills, and Abilities
6.4 Responding to a Written Test That Causes Disparate Impact
   6.4.1 Score Banding and Race Norming
   6.4.2 Cutoff Scores and Rank Order Selection
   6.4.3 Is an Employer Liable for Disparate Impact Where the Bottom Line Is Good?
6.5 The Written Test Dilemma: The U.S. Supreme Court’s Decision in Ricci v. DeStefano
   6.5.1 The Background
   6.5.2 Constructing the Test
   6.5.3 Results of the Tests
   6.5.4 The Lawsuit
   6.5.5 The Legal Analysis: The Majority Opinion
   6.5.6 Legal Analysis: The Dissent
6.6 After Ricci v. DeStefano: Should a Local Government Employer Use Written Examinations for Hiring and Promotion?
6.7 A Note about the Americans with Disabilities Act and Employment Testing
### Chapter 7

**Testing of Applicants and Candidates for Promotion: Physical Ability Tests and Assessment Centers**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7.1 Physical Ability Tests</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1.1 Using Physical Ability Tests Validated for Other Employers</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1.2 Validating Cutoff Scores for Physical Ability Testing That Have a Disparate Impact on Women</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2 Assessment Centers</td>
<td>256</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.1 An Example of a Valid Law Enforcement Assessment Center</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.2 An Example of a Firefighter Assessment Center That Could Not Be Validated</td>
<td>260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.3 Assessment Centers in Sum</td>
<td>262</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Chapter 8

**Background Investigations of Applicants for Employment: Criminal Records, Credit History, Reference, and Internet Checks**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8.1 Reasons for Conducting Background Investigations</td>
<td>266</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1.1 Fear of Negligent Hiring Claims Not a Reason to Conduct a Background Check</td>
<td>266</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2 Criminal History Record Checks</td>
<td>267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2.1 Blanket Disqualification of Applicants with Criminal Records Prohibited</td>
<td>268</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2.2 How to Construct a Targeted Screen</td>
<td>276</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2.3 The Catch-22 for Applicants</td>
<td>279</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2.4 Litigating the Criminal Record Exclusion Disparate Impact Discrimination Claim</td>
<td>280</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2.5 A Note on Criminal History Checks and Disparate Treatment Claims under Title VII</td>
<td>281</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2.6 Best Practices for Employers Who Do Criminal Records Checks</td>
<td>283</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3 Credit History Checks</td>
<td>284</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3.1 Reasons Why Employers Perform Credit History Checks</td>
<td>285</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3.2 The Legal Status of Credit Checks for Employment Purposes</td>
<td>287</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3.3 Another Catch-22 for Applicants</td>
<td>291</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
8.4 Reference Checks 293
  8.4.1 No Liability for Defamation for Employers Who Give Honest Evaluations of Former Employees 294
  8.4.2 Reference Checks and the Right to “Informational Privacy” 294

8.5 Internet Background Checks 297
  8.5.1 Some Kinds of Information an Employer May Want to Avoid Acquiring 298
  8.5.2 Asking Applicants to Display Their Social Media Pages and Posts 302
  8.5.3 Using the Internet to Learn More about Applicants while Protecting against Liability for Unlawful Employment Practices 304

8.6 Using Outside Agencies to Conduct Background Checks: The Fair Credit Reporting Act 305
  8.6.1 The FCRA’s Authorization and Disclosure Requirements 305
  8.6.2 No Obligation for Employers to Reconsider Applicants Rejected on the Basis of Incorrect Information Supplied by a Third-Party Consumer Reporting Agency 308

Chapter 9

Hiring Employees versus Engaging Independent Contractors 311

9.1 Employee or Independent Contractor: A Hypothetical 315

9.2 An Agreement to Work as an Independent Contractor Has No Legal Significance 316
  9.2.1 The Classic Independent Contractor 317
  9.2.2 The Fair Labor Standards Act Test to Determine Whether a Worker Is an Employee or an Independent Contractor 317
  9.2.3 The Internal Revenue Code Test to Determine Whether a Worker Is an Employee or an Independent Contractor 319

9.3 Five Key Factors 323
  9.3.1 The Nature and Degree of the Employer’s Control over the Worker 323
  9.3.2 Opportunity for Profit or Loss 328
  9.3.3 Integral Part of the Employer’s Business 331
  9.3.4 Exclusivity and Duration of the Relationship 332
  9.3.5 The Right to Discharge the Worker 334

9.4 The Conclusion: Paradise County Has Three New Employees 335
## 9.5 Some Difficult Cases 335

### 9.5.1 Positions Funded through Grants 335

### 9.5.2 Adjunct or Part-Time Instructors in Colleges, Recreation and Parks Departments, or Employee Training and Development Programs 337

### 9.5.3 Physicians 338

## 9.6 A Price to Pay 340

## 9.7 Worker Classification and Employee Benefits 341

## 9.8 Most Public Sector Workers Are Employees, Not Independent Contractors 344

### Chapter 10

**Applicant Records: Confidentiality and Retention** 345

### 10.1 Confidentiality of Applicant Records 347

#### 10.1.1 Disclosure of Applicant Information to the Public 348

#### 10.1.2 Disclosure of Applicant Information within the Hiring Organization 349

#### 10.1.3 Confidentiality of Applicant Medical and Genetic Information 350

### 10.2 Aggregate Information about Applicants Required for Equal Employment Opportunity Commission Reporting Purposes 351

### 10.3 Retention of Applicant Records 352

#### 10.3.1 Retention of Applicant Records under Federal Antidiscrimination Statutes 353

#### 10.3.2 Retention of Applicant Records under North Carolina Law 354

### Appendix 1

**Application of Employment Laws to Small Employers** 357

### Appendix 2

**Affirmative Action Today in North Carolina Government Employment** 361
Appendix 3
Validation of Employment Selection Devices That Cause Disparate Impact 385

Appendix 4
Model Summary of Employee Rights for Fair Credit Reporting Act Compliance 391

Appendix 5
Equal Employment Opportunity Commission State and Local Government Information (EEO-4) 395

Case Index 401

Statute Index 415

Subject Index 425
Preface

Like my previous book, *Employee Benefits Law for North Carolina Local Government Employers*, published in 2009, *Recruitment and Selection Law for Local Government Employers* grew out of my School of Government experiences in teaching and advising local government employers. It is the first in a series of books that will replace the School of Government’s general employment reference work, *Employment Law: A Guide for North Carolina Public Employers*, the third edition of which is now out of date. Rather than write a book that surveys employment law, I have decided to write a series of books about distinct topics in employment law, including the hiring process, the Fair Labor Standards Act, constitutional issues, privacy in public employment, and discharge and discipline. This book addresses the process of recruitment and selection, which can be particularly challenging for employers as it is governed by a patchwork of federal and state laws. Although many discussions are applicable to community college and state government hiring, the book focuses on the recruitment and selection issues that face local government employers.

I had two main goals in writing *Recruitment and Selection Law for Local Government Employers*. First, I wanted to answer some of the basic, recurring questions about what federal and state law requires of public employers with respect to advertising openings and interviewing applicants. These are topics about which I receive regular inquiries from local government employers by telephone or email. I also spend considerable time discussing these topics with participants in the School of Government’s Introduction
to Public Employment Law course and its Municipal and County Administration course. Second, I wanted to bring some coherence to an area where the many different sources of law sometimes leave human resources personnel and local government attorneys feeling concerned that one or another legal consideration may have been overlooked. I have seen how committed North Carolina’s local government and community college employers are to achieving a workforce composed of individuals who have excellent training and skills, have a commitment to public service, and also reflect the diversity of the communities they serve. My broader goal is to help them do this by providing a more in-depth look at the legal issues that typically arise at each stage of the hiring process than a survey of employment law is able to do.

I would like to thank my School of Government colleague Bob Joyce for a detailed reading of the manuscript and for his many helpful comments and suggestions. I would also like to thank Mike Smith, Dean of the School of Government, for supporting this project by approving me for a writing leave during the 2011–2012 academic year.

Diane M. Juffras
Professor of Public Law and Government
March 2013