North Carolina Capital Case Law Handbook


Jeffrey B. Welty
The School of Government at the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill works to improve the lives of North Carolinians by engaging in practical scholarship that helps public officials and citizens understand and improve state and local government. Established in 1931 as the Institute of Government, the School provides educational, advisory, and research services for state and local governments. The School of Government is also home to a nationally ranked graduate program in public administration and specialized centers focused on information technology and environmental finance.

As the largest university-based local government training, advisory, and research organization in the United States, the School of Government offers up to 200 courses, webinars, and specialized conferences for more than 12,000 public officials each year. In addition, faculty members annually publish approximately fifty books, book chapters, bulletins, and other reference works related to state and local government. Each day that the General Assembly is in session, the School produces the Daily Bulletin, which reports on the day’s activities for members of the legislature and others who need to follow the course of legislation.

The Master of Public Administration Program is a full-time, two-year program that serves up to sixty students annually. It consistently ranks among the best public administration graduate programs in the country, particularly in city management. With courses ranging from public policy analysis to ethics and management, the program educates leaders for local, state, and federal governments and nonprofit organizations.

Operating support for the School of Government’s programs and activities comes from many sources, including state appropriations, local government membership dues, private contributions, publication sales, course fees, and service contracts. Visit www.sog.unc.edu or call 919.966.5381 for more information on the School’s courses, publications, programs, and services.

© 2013
School of Government
The University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill
Use of this publication for commercial purposes or without acknowledgment of its source is prohibited. Reproducing, distributing, or otherwise making available to a non-purchaser the entire publication, or a substantial portion of it, without express permission, is prohibited.

Printed in the United States of America
17 16 15 14 13 1 2 3 4 5
∞ This publication is printed on permanent, acid-free paper in compliance with the North Carolina General Statutes.
∞ Printed on recycled paper
Contents

Preface

Chapter 1

Introduction

A. Origins of the Current Capital Punishment Statute ........................................ 3
B. Constitutionality of the Current Capital Punishment Statute .......................... 3
C. Scope of the Current Capital Punishment Statute .......................................... 4
   Included and Excluded Offenses ................................................................. 4
   Included and Excluded Defendants ........................................................... 4
   Defendants under 18 ................................................................................. 4
   Mentally Retarded Defendants ................................................................. 4
   Enmund Defendants ................................................................................. 5
D. Prosecutorial Discretion in Seeking the Death Penalty .................................... 5
E. Life Imprisonment ....................................................................................... 5
F. Overview of Capital Case Procedures .......................................................... 6
   Pretrial ........................................................................................................ 6
   Bifurcated Trial ......................................................................................... 6
   The Capital Sentencing Hearing ............................................................... 7
   Appellate and Other Postconviction Review .............................................. 10
   Manner of Execution .............................................................................. 11

Chapter 2

Selected Pretrial Issues

A. Indictment for First-Degree Murder ............................................................... 15
   Charging Language .................................................................................. 15
   Amendments to the Indictment and Variances .......................................... 16
   Lesser Included Offenses of Short-Form Indictment ................................... 17
B. Theories of First-Degree Murder ................................................................. 17
   Generally .................................................................................................. 17
   Premeditation and Deliberation ................................................................ 19
   Felony Murder ......................................................................................... 20
   Predicate Felonies .................................................................................. 20
   Continuous Transaction Doctrine .............................................................. 22
Murder by Torture ................................................................. 23
Murder by Poisoning ........................................................... 23
Murder by Lying in Wait ....................................................... 24

C. Prosecutor’s Decision to Seek the Death Penalty ............ 25
D. Rule 24 Mandatory Pretrial Conference ........................... 27
E. Pretrial Hearing to Determine Sufficiency of Evidence of Aggravating Circumstances .......... 28
F. Pretrial Hearing on Mental Retardation ............................ 29
G. Joinder and Severance ..................................................... 29
  Case Summaries: Joinder of Offenses or Denial of Severance Was Error .................. 30
  Case Summaries: Joinder of Offenses or Denial of Severance Was Proper .............. 30
  Case Summaries: Joinder of Defendants or Denial of Severance Was Error .......... 31
  Case Summaries: Joinder of Defendants or Denial of Severance Was Proper ....... 32
H. Defendant’s Capacity to Proceed .................................... 33
  Case Summaries: Defendant’s Capacity to Proceed ..................................... 35
I. Defendant’s Right to Counsel and Related Issues ........... 37
J. Defendant’s Right to the Assistance of Investigators and Experts .......................... 42
  Case Summaries: Failure to Appoint Mental Health Expert Was Error ............... 44
  Case Summaries: Failure to Appoint Mental Health Expert Was Proper ............ 45
  Case Summaries: Failure to Appoint Fingerprint Expert Was Error .................. 46
  Case Summaries: Failure to Appoint Fingerprint Expert Was Proper ............... 47
  Case Summaries: Failure to Appoint Pathologist Was Proper ......................... 47
  Case Summaries: Failure to Appoint Private Investigator Was Proper .............. 48
  Case Summaries: Failure to Appoint Jury Selection Expert or Statistician Was Proper .... 48
  Case Summaries: Failure to Appoint Other Experts Was Proper ...................... 48
K. Discovery ................................................................. 49
  Overview of Statutory Discovery ...................................... 49
  Statutory Discovery Procedures ....................................... 49
    Need for Request .......................................................... 49
    Timing of Request ...................................................... 50
    Timing of Discovery .................................................... 50
    Remedies for Violations .............................................. 51
  Scope of Statutory Discovery for the Defendant ...................... 51
  Scope of Statutory Discovery for the State .................................. 52
  Statutory Discovery Regarding Expert Witnesses .................. 53
  Constitutional Discovery Rights ....................................... 54
    Right to Material Evidence That Is Exculpatory or Mitigating ..................... 55
    State’s Obligation Not to Use False Evidence .................................. 55
    Lost or Destroyed Evidence .......................................... 56
L. Discrimination in Selecting Grand Jury Foreperson .......... 56
M. Discrimination in Selecting the Jury Panel and the Fair Cross Section Requirement .............. 58
  Case Summaries: Discrimination in Selecting the Jury Panel .......................... 58
N. Statutory Violations in Selecting the Jury Panel ............... 60
O. Motions for Change of Venue and Special Venire ............ 60
  Case Summaries: Denial of Defendant’s Motion for Change of Venue Was Error .... 62
  Case Summaries: Denial of Defendant’s Motion for Change of Venue Was Proper .... 62
  Case Summaries: Defendant’s Motion for a Special Venire .......................... 63
P. Defendant’s Motion for a Continuance .......................................................... 64
   Case Summaries: Denial of Defendant’s Motion for Continuance Was Proper .... 65
   Case Summaries: Denial of Defendant’s Motion for Continuance Was Error .... 67

Q. Defendant’s Motion to Withdraw Guilty Plea .............................................. 69

Chapter 3
Selected Trial Issues
A. Jurisdiction ........................................................................................................ 73
B. Defendant’s Right to Be Present at Trial .......................................................... 74
C. Jury Selection ...................................................................................................... 79
   Generally .......................................................................................................... 79
   Prospective Jurors’ Views about the Death Penalty ........................................... 81
      Jurors Who Are Biased Against the Death Penalty ........................................ 81
      Case Summaries: Jurors Who Are Biased Against the Death Penalty ......... 83
      Jurors Who Are Biased in Favor of the Death Penalty ................................... 85
      Case Summaries: Jurors Who Are Biased in Favor of the Death Penalty .... 86
   Proper and Improper Voir Dire Questions ......................................................... 88
      Case Summaries: Questions about the Death Penalty’s Cost, Deterrent Value, and Similar Matters .... 88
      Case Summaries: Questions about Parole Eligibility ...................................... 89
      Case Summaries: “Stakeout” Questions about Particular Facts ...................... 89
      Case Summaries: Questions about the Defendant’s Failure to Testify or to Put on a Defense .......... 92
      Case Summaries: Questions about Whether Jurors Have the Personal Strength to Return a Sentence of Death ...................................................... 93
      Case Summaries: Questions about Jurors’ Ability to Withstand Pressure during Deliberations ......................... 93
      Case Summaries: Questions about Jurors’ Personal Lives, Experiences, and Beliefs ......................... 94
      Case Summaries: Questions about Race and Sex .......................................... 94
      Case Summaries: Other Proper and Improper Questions ......................... 95
   Batson and Discrimination .................................................................................... 95
      Prima Facie Showing ..................................................................................... 96
      Case Summaries: Prima Facie Showing ......................................................... 97
      Neutral Justification ....................................................................................... 99
      Pretext for Purposeful Discrimination ............................................................ 100
      Case Summaries: Pretext for Purposeful Discrimination ................................ 101
      Remedies ......................................................................................................... 102
D. Jury Administration ............................................................................................ 103
E. Presence and Conduct of Spectators ................................................................ 106
F. Evidence ............................................................................................................ 107
G. Closing Argument ............................................................................................. 108
   Number of Arguments and Time Limitations ................................................... 109
   Defense Lawyer’s Admission of Defendant’s Guilt of Lesser-Included Offenses .... 109
   Defense Lawyer’s Statement of Punishment Severity ....................................... 110
H. Jury Instructions and Verdicts .......................................................... 111
  Jury Instructions .................................................................................. 111
  Verdicts .................................................................................................. 113

Chapter 4

The Capital Sentencing Hearing

A. Overview ............................................................................................ 117
B. General Constitutional Issues ............................................................. 118
C. Selected Evidence Issues ................................................................. 119
  Rules of Evidence at Sentencing Hearing ........................................... 119
  Victim Impact Evidence ....................................................................... 120
    Case Summaries: Victim Impact Evidence ........................................ 120
  State’s Offer of Rebuttal Evidence of Defendant’s Bad Character ....... 123
    Case Summaries: State’s Offer of Rebuttal Evidence of Defendant’s Bad Character ................................................................. 123
D. Jury Argument ..................................................................................... 124
  Parole Eligibility ................................................................................... 125
  Other Issues .......................................................................................... 126
    Case Summaries: Addressing Jurors Individually ............................. 126
    Case Summaries: References and Comparisons to People and Events Not in Evidence ............................................................ 126
    Case Summaries: Prosecutor’s Reference to Victim and Victim’s Family ............................................................ 127
    Case Summaries: Prosecutor’s Reference to Deterrence ................. 127
    Case Summaries: Prosecutor’s Reference to Quality of Life in Prison ............................................................ 128
    Case Summaries: Prosecutor’s Reference to Mercy or Sympathy .... 128
    Case Summaries: Prosecutor’s Reference to Mitigating Circumstances .................................................................................... 128
    Case Summaries: Prosecutor’s Reference to Aggravating Circumstance Not Submitted ........................................................... 129
    Case Summaries: Prosecutor’s Reference to Defendant’s Demeanor and Lack of Remorse .......................................................... 129
    Case Summaries: Prosecutor’s Request That Jurors Put Themselves in Victim’s Place ............................................................. 130
    Case Summaries: Prosecutor’s Reference to Community Sentiment ............................................................. 131
    Case Summaries: Prosecutor’s Biblical References .......................... 131
    Case Summaries: Prosecutor’s Reference to Defendant’s Exercise of Rights ................................................................. 132
    Case Summaries: Prosecutor’s Disparagement of Defendant .......... 132
    Case Summaries: Prosecutor’s Disparagement of Witnesses .......... 133
    Case Summaries: Prosecutor’s Reference to Appellate Review ....... 133
    Case Summaries: Defendant’s Reference to Life Sentence if Jury Does Not Agree .......................................................... 133
    Case Summaries: Defendant’s Description of Execution Procedure ..... 133
    Case Summaries: Defendant’s Reference to Absence of Aggravating Circumstances ............................................................. 134
    Case Summaries: Defense Counsel’s Admission That Defendant Committed Prior Crimes ......................................................... 134
    Case Summaries: Defendant’s Reference to Residual Doubt .......... 134
E. Defendant’s Lack of Right of Allocution ............................................. 134
F. Replacement of Juror or Entire Jury ................................................... 135
G. Enmund Issue: When May the Death Penalty Be Imposed on a Defendant Who Is an Accomplice to Felony Murder? .................... 135
H. Mental Retardation .......................................................................... 137
Contents  | vii

I. Jury Deliberations and Related Issues ................................................................. 139
  Requirement of Unanimity and “Reasonable Time” to Reach Unanimous Recommendation ................................................................. 139
    Case Summaries: “Reasonable Time” to Reach Unanimous Recommendation ................................................................. 140
  Verdict Form .................................................................................................................. 141
  Juror Misconduct ......................................................................................................... 142
  Polling Jury about Its Recommendation ...................................................................... 142
    Case Summaries: Polling Jury about Its Recommendation ........................................ 143
J. Issues Pertinent to Second or Subsequent Capital Sentencing Hearings ..................... 144
    Case Summaries: Issues Pertinent to Capital Resentencing Hearings .......................... 145

Chapter 5
Aggravating Circumstances

A. General Rules Concerning Aggravating Circumstances ........................................ 149
  The Use of the Same Evidence to Support Multiple Aggravating Circumstances ........... 152
    Case Summaries: Multiple Aggravating Circumstances Properly Submitted—Separate Evidence ................................................................. 153
    Case Summaries: Multiple Aggravating Circumstances Properly Submitted—Different Aspects ................................................................. 155
    Case Summaries: Multiple Aggravating Circumstances Improperly Submitted .......... 156
B. Aggravating Circumstance (e)(1): Murder Committed by Incarcerated Defendant ........ 157
C. Aggravating Circumstance (e)(2): Defendant Previously Convicted of Capital Felony . 157
  What Constitutes a Capital Felony .................................................................................. 157
  What Constitutes a Conviction ...................................................................................... 158
  Timing of the Prior Capital Felony .............................................................................. 159
  Method of Proof .......................................................................................................... 159
    Case Summaries: Submission of (e)(3) Rather Than (e)(2) ........................................ 159
    Case Summaries: Propriety of Submitting Multiple Aggravating Circumstances ...... 159
D. Aggravating Circumstance (e)(3): Defendant Previously Convicted of Violent Felony .... 160
  What Constitutes a Violent Felony ................................................................................ 160
  What Constitutes a Conviction ...................................................................................... 162
  Timing of the Prior Violent Felony .............................................................................. 163
  Method of Proof .......................................................................................................... 164
  Proof of Circumstances Underlying the Conviction .................................................... 165
  Jury Instructions ......................................................................................................... 168
    Case Summaries: Propriety of Submitting Multiple Aggravating Circumstances ...... 168
E. Aggravating Circumstance (e)(4): Murder Committed to Prevent Arrest or to Effect Escape . 168
  Case Summaries: Sufficient Evidence of Aggravating Circumstance (e)(4) ................. 169
  Case Summaries: Insufficient Evidence of Aggravating Circumstance (e)(4) ............... 171
  Case Summaries: Propriety of Submitting Multiple Aggravating Circumstances ......... 171
F. Aggravating Circumstance (e)(5): Murder Committed During Specified Felony ........... 173
  Felony Murder and (e)(5) .............................................................................................. 173
  Connection between Murder and the Specified Felony ............................................... 175
  Finding of Multiple (e)(5) Circumstances .................................................................... 176
  Relationship between Aggravating Circumstances (e)(5) and (e)(6) ............................ 177
    Case Summaries: Propriety of Submitting Multiple Aggravating Circumstances ...... 179
    Case Summaries: Miscellaneous Matters .................................................................. 181
G. Aggravating Circumstance (e)(6): Murder Committed for Pecuniary Gain .......................... 181
   Connection between the Murder and the Pecuniary Gain ............................................. 181
   Relationship between Aggravating Circumstances (e)(5) and (e)(6) .............................. 184
   Case Summaries: Propriety of Submitting Multiple Aggravating Circumstances ............ 186

H. Aggravating Circumstance (e)(7): Murder Committed to Hinder Governmental Function or Law Enforcement ................................................................. 187
   Case Summaries: Aggravating Circumstance (e)(7) ....................................................... 187

I. Aggravating Circumstance (e)(8): Murder Committed Against Law Enforcement Officer or Specified Others ................................................................. 188
   Case Summaries: Aggravating Circumstance (e)(8) ....................................................... 189

J. Aggravating Circumstance (e)(9): Murder Especially Heinous, Atrocious, or Cruel .......... 191
   Case Summaries: Constitutional Issues ........................................................................... 192
   Case Summaries: Jury Instruction Issues ......................................................................... 193
   Case Summaries: Sufficient Evidence of Aggravating Circumstance (e)(9) ..................... 193
   Case Summaries: Insufficient Evidence of Aggravating Circumstance (e)(9) ................. 201
   Case Summaries: Propriety of Submitting Multiple Aggravating Circumstances ......... 202

K. Aggravating Circumstance (e)(10): Defendant’s Use of Hazardous Weapon to Endanger Multiple Others ................................................................. 203
   Case Summaries: Sufficient Evidence of Aggravating Circumstance (e)(10) ................. 204
   Case Summaries: Propriety of Submitting Multiple Aggravating Circumstances ......... 204
   Case Summaries: Jury Instruction on Aggravating Circumstance (e)(10) ....................... 205

L. Aggravating Circumstance (e)(11): Murder Part of Course of Violent Conduct ............ 205
   Case Summaries: Sufficient Evidence of Aggravating Circumstance (e)(11) ................. 205
   Case Summaries: Propriety of Submitting Multiple Aggravating Circumstances ......... 208
   Case Summaries: What Constitutes a Crime of Violence ................................................ 209
   Case Summaries: Jury Instruction on Aggravating Circumstance (e)(11) ....................... 209

Chapter 6
Mitigating Circumstances
A. General Rules Concerning Mitigating Circumstances .................................................... 214

B. Peremptory Jury Instructions for Mitigating Circumstances ........................................... 217
   Case Summaries: Evidence Did Not Support Peremptory Instruction ......................... 218
   Case Summaries: Evidence Supported Peremptory Instruction ..................................... 221
   Case Summaries: Content of Peremptory Instruction ..................................................... 222
   Case Summaries: Timely Written Request for Peremptory Instruction ......................... 222
   Case Summaries: Content of Request for Peremptory Instruction .................................. 223

C. Mitigating Circumstances and Resentencing Hearings .................................................. 223

D. Mitigating Circumstance (f)(1): No Significant Prior Criminal History ......................... 224
   Case Summaries: Sufficient Evidence of Mitigating Circumstance (f)(1) ......................... 225
   Case Summaries: Insufficient Evidence of Mitigating Circumstance (f)(1) ................. 228
   Case Summaries: Evidence Did Not Support Peremptory Instruction ......................... 233
   Case Summaries: Requirement That Criminal Activity Occur before Commission of Murder ................................................................. 233
   Case Summaries: State’s Evidence Offered in Rebuttal to (f)(1) ..................................... 234
   Case Summaries: Procedural Issues .............................................................................. 235
E. Mitigating Circumstance (f)(2): Under the Influence of a Mental or Emotional Disturbance 235
   Case Summaries: Sufficient Evidence of Mitigating Circumstance (f)(2) 236
   Case Summaries: Insufficient Evidence of Mitigating Circumstance (f)(2) 236
   Case Summaries: Evidence Supported Peremptory Instruction 238
   Case Summaries: Evidence Did Not Support Peremptory Instruction 238
   Case Summaries: Miscellaneous Issues Concerning Mitigating Circumstance (f)(2) 239

F. Mitigating Circumstance (f)(3): Victim Voluntary Participant in Murder 240
   Case Summaries: Mitigating Circumstance (f)(3) 240

G. Mitigating Circumstance (f)(4): Defendant’s Participation Was Relatively Minor 240
   Case Summaries: Sufficient Evidence of Mitigating Circumstance (f)(4) 241
   Case Summaries: Insufficient Evidence of Mitigating Circumstance (f)(4) 241
   Case Summaries: Miscellaneous Issues Concerning Mitigating Circumstance (f)(4) 241

H. Mitigating Circumstance (f)(5): Under Duress or Domination of Another Person 242
   Case Summaries: Mitigating Circumstance (f)(5) 242

I. Mitigating Circumstance (f)(6): Defendant’s Impaired Capacity 243
   Case Summaries: Sufficient Evidence of Mitigating Circumstance (f)(6) 245
   Case Summaries: Insufficient Evidence of Mitigating Circumstance (f)(6) 247
   Case Summaries: Evidence Did Not Support Peremptory Instruction 249
   Case Summaries: Jury Instruction Issues 250
   Case Summaries: Qualifications of Expert to Testify about Mitigating Circumstance (f)(6) 250

J. Mitigating Circumstance (f)(7): Defendant’s Age at Time of Murder 250
   Case Summaries: Sufficient Evidence of Mitigating Circumstance (f)(7) 251
   Case Summaries: Insufficient Evidence of Mitigating Circumstance (f)(7) 251
   Case Summaries: Evidence Did Not Support Peremptory Instruction 253
   Case Summaries: Jury Instruction Issues 254

K. Mitigating Circumstance (f)(8): Defendant’s Assistance to the State 254
   Case Summaries: Mitigating Circumstance (f)(8) 254

L. Mitigating Circumstance (f)(9): Any Other Circumstance Having Mitigating Value 255
   Case Summaries: Defendant’s Good Conduct in Jail or Prison or Adjustment to Prison Life 256
   Case Summaries: Mental Age of the Defendant 257
   Case Summaries: Defendant’s Sentences for Other Criminal Convictions 257
   Case Summaries: Consideration of Accomplice’s Sentence or Plea Bargain 258
   Case Summaries: Absence of Aggravating Circumstance or Absence of Additional Theory of First-Degree Murder 259
   Case Summaries: Residual Doubt Concerning Defendant’s Guilt 260
   Case Summaries: Impact of Sentence on, or Opinion Regarding Sentence of, Third Parties 260
   Case Summaries: Sympathy for the Defendant 261
   Case Summaries: Miscellaneous Matters 261

Chapter 7
The Racial Justice Act

A. Background 265
B. Issues under the Amended RJA 267
   Cognizable Claims 267
   Impact on the Defendant’s Case 268
Timing of Claim ......................................................... 269
Pleading a Claim ..................................................... 269
Scheduling or Deferring a Hearing on a Claim .................. 270
Discovery ............................................................... 270
Admissible Evidence ................................................ 271
Sufficient Evidence .................................................. 271
Relief ................................................................. 272
Appeal ................................................................. 272
C. Defendants Who May Be Entitled to Proceed under the Original RJA .. 273
Ex Post Facto Considerations ...................................... 273
Vested Rights ......................................................... 274

Case Index ............................................................. 275

Descriptive Word Index ............................................ 287
Preface

This book is intended as a reference for North Carolina judges and lawyers handling capital cases. It focuses mainly on the unique aspects of capital proceedings, rather than on elements common to all criminal cases.

The name of the book comes from the fact that it contains many summaries of appellate cases. For this edition, the summaries have been updated with decisions rendered through the end of 2012. Of course, the book also addresses relevant statutory law, and that treatment, too, has been updated. Furthermore, this edition contains somewhat more analysis and discussion than previous versions, and it contains an entirely new chapter on the Racial Justice Act.

This edition builds on the work of my colleague Bob Farb, who wrote the previous editions, published in 1996 and 2004. He also read and commented on a draft of this edition. Jessie Smith, Jamie Markham, and other School of Government faculty members also reviewed this book, and research attorney Tom Tyner helped me sift through recent court decisions. The Publications Division of the School of Government turned my manuscript into this polished final product, and my editor, Melissa Twomey, was efficient, patient, and unflappable.

Finally, I am deeply grateful to the prosecutors and defense attorneys who reviewed and commented on a draft of this book. They did so notwithstanding their already busy schedules, and the book is much better for their contributions. Obviously, whatever errors remain are my own.

I welcome comments, positive or negative, on the structure, organization, or content of this book. I may be reached at (919) 843-8474, or by email at welty@sog.unc.edu.

Jeff Welty
Chapel Hill
Spring 2013